

# **Report of the Second Meeting of the Review Committee on the Functioning of the International Health Regulations (2005) in Relation to Pandemic (H1N1) 2009**

## **THE INTERSESSIONAL PERIOD**

As agreed during its first meeting in April 2010 the Committee has continued its work through teleconference and electronic exchange.

Two rounds of teleconferences by each of the 5 technical subcommittees were held from 4 to 11 May and from 31 May to 4 June.

The three pandemic related technical subcommittees continued their review of:

- capacity and preparedness
- alert and risk assessment
- response

They organized their work according to decisions taken during the H1N1 (2009) pandemic.

A fourth technical subcommittee focused its work on reviewing the functions of the IHR with an emphasis on public health events outside of the pandemic as well as experiences, surveys and studies providing insights into progress with various aspects of IHR implementation.

The fifth technical subcommittee reviewed communication issues related both to the pandemic and the IHR.

All subcommittees continued their deliberations initiated during the April meeting to identify key issues and information needs. They also identified key groups of persons to be invited to assist in contributing to the review through interviews that the RC will conduct. These groups include national authorities at political and technical levels such as the IHR national focal points, international organizations including WHO secretariat, industry, media and critics. The first round of interviews took place during the Second review committee meeting held at WHO headquarters from 30 June to 2 July. The committee will conduct additional interviews beginning in September of this year.

During the intersessional period two members withdrew from the Committee due to their concerns that their close association with the work of WHO during the H1N1 pandemic could be perceived as inconsistent with the Committee's role in providing an independent evaluation of this work. Although no longer members of the Committee, both Professor John Mackenzie and Dr Tony Evans will continue to contribute to the work of the Review Committee when called upon to do so as expert witnesses.

The IHR review was on the agenda of Committee A of the World Health Assembly (item 11.2). The Chair of the Review Committee attended Committee A for these discussions, listened closely to interventions by Member States and responded to issues related to the Committee and the IHR review process.

## **ORGANIZATION AND PROCESS OF THE MEETING**

The second meeting of the Committee took place at WHO headquarters in Geneva, 30 June – 2 July 2010, with the following provisional agenda:

1. Welcome, introduction and remarks by the Chair
2. Statements by States Parties and affiliated organizations
3. Interviews
4. Deliberative sessions
5. Discussion and adoption of the Report of the Second Meeting of the Review Committee

Of the current 27 members of the Review Committee, 25 were present at this meeting.

Working group moderators presented summaries of their subcommittee deliberations. As at the initial session in April 2010, the following observers were invited to the meeting: representatives of States Parties to the IHR and the United Nations and its specialized agencies and other relevant intergovernmental organizations or nongovernmental organizations in official relations with WHO. Further, persons representing a number of different groups—national authorities, National IHR Focal Points, industry, media, critics of WHO, the Open-Ended Working Group on Pandemic Influenza Preparedness: Sharing of Influenza Viruses and Access to Vaccines and other Benefits, the WHO Strategic Advisory Group of Experts on vaccination, and other international organizations—were interviewed by the Committee.

## **SUMMARY OF STATES PARTIES' INTERVENTIONS**

No States Parties made formal interventions from the floor. However, the Chair invited States Parties to submit statements for the Committee's consideration.

## **SUMMARY OF INTERVIEWS**

On the first day, interviews were conducted via videoconference with the following individuals: Dr Masato Mugitani, Assistant Minister for Global Health and Director-General of the Special Task Force for Pandemic Influenza, Ministry of Health, Labor and Welfare, Japan; Dr Suresh Jadhav, Executive Director of Quality Assurance & Regulatory Affairs, Serum Institute of India and Former President of the Developing Countries Vaccine Manufacturers' Network; Mr Tony Colgate, Scientific Coordinator of the International Federation of Pharmaceutical Manufacturers and Associations and Manager, Vaccines & Diagnostics Influenza Technical Affairs, Novartis; Dr Dirk Glaesser, Chief of Risk and Crisis Management, United Nations World Tourism Organization; Dr David Salisbury, Director of Immunisation, Department of Health, England, and Chair, WHO Strategic Advisory Group of Experts on Immunization; Dr David Reddy, Global Pandemic Taskforce Leader and Ms Catherine Steele, International Head of Communications, F. Hoffman-La Roche Ltd.; Dr Andrin Oswald, Head of Vaccines and Diagnostics, Novartis; RADM Stephen Redd, Director, Influenza Coordination Unit, US Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, United States of America; and Dr Hugo Lopez-Gatell Ramirez, Assistant Director General for Epidemiology, Ministry of Health and National IHR Focal Point, Mexico.

Prof Didier Houssin, General-Director for Health and Interministerial Delegate on Avian Influenza for the Ministry of Health in France, participated via teleconference.

The following individuals participated in proceedings in person: Ambassador Bente Angell-Hansen of Norway and Ambassador J.J Gomez-Camacho of Mexico, co-chairs of the Open-Ended Working Group on Pandemic Influenza Preparedness: Sharing of Influenza Viruses and Access to Vaccines and Other Benefits; Dr David Butler-Jones, Chief Public Health Officer, Public Health Agency of Canada; Dr David Nabarro, Senior Coordinator for Avian & Human Influenza, United Nations System Influenza Coordination; and Ms Carmen Amela Heras, Representative for IHR Issues of the Directorate General for Public Health, Ministry of Health and Social Policy and National IHR Focal Point, Spain.

The second day began with another round of interviews. Via video conference, the interviewees were: Dr Thomas Jefferson, Cochrane Vaccines Field; Dr Fiona Godlee, Editor-in-Chief, *BMJ*; Dr Norbert Hehme, Chair of the Influenza Vaccine Supply International Task Force, International Federation of Pharmaceutical Manufacturers and Associations and Biologicals, GlaxoSmithKline; Dr Paul Benkimoun, Medical Journalist, *Le Monde*, France; Prof David Harper, Director General for Health Improvement and Protection, Department of Health, England; Mrs Else JB Andersen, Assistant Deputy Director-General, Ministry of Health and Care Service, Norway; Mr Morten Randmæl, Director, Emergency Preparedness Department, Directorate of Health, Norway; Mr Bjørn Iversen, Acting Department Director, Norwegian Institute of Public Health, Norway; and Mrs Ine Måreng, Assistant Director-General, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Norway; Dr Lars Schaade, Head of Center, Biological Safety, Robert Koch Institute, Germany; and Dr Alex Thiermann, President, Terrestrial Animal Health Code Commission and Senior Advisor to the OIE Director General and Dr Kate Glynn, Head of Mission in the OIE Scientific and Technical Department and Focal Point for Animal-Human Health Interface Matters, World Organization for Animal Health.

Mr Paul Flynn, Parliamentarian, British Labour Party and Representative at the Council of Europe, participated in the proceedings in person, as did Dr Gérard Krause, Director, Department for Infectious Disease Epidemiology, National Public Health Institute, Germany.

## **SUMMARY OF DELIBERATIVE SESSIONS**

The Committee held its first deliberative session on the afternoon of the second day. During this session, they discussed a preliminary draft outline for the final report. They also held a preliminary discussion on some of the important issues to be covered in the report.

In deliberative session on the morning of the third day of the meeting, the Committee continued its discussion of the preliminary draft outline and its plan of work for producing the report.

The Chair proposed a tentative schedule for the remainder of the Committee's work, with a view towards conducting further interviews at a meeting tentatively scheduled for 27–29 September 2010. The next meeting of the Committee is scheduled for 3–5 November 2010 in Geneva. It is also anticipated that the Committee will assemble in January 2011 to review a draft of its report. A completed report is expected to be presented to the Sixty-fourth World Health Assembly in May 2011.

The Committee discussed and endorsed the Chairman's proposed meeting report.

## **Appendix**

### **Members of the Review Committee on the functioning of the IHR (2005) and assessment of the international preparedness and response to the pandemic influenza A (H1N1) 2009**

Dr Preben Aavitsland, Department Director/State Epidemiologist, Department of Infectious Disease Epidemiology, Norwegian Institute of Public Health, Oslo, Norway

Professor Tjandra Y. Aditama, Director General of Disease Control and Environmental Health, Ministry of Health, Jakarta, Indonesia

Dr Silvia Bino, Associate Professor of Infectious Diseases, Head, Control of Infectious Diseases Department, Institute of Public Health, Tirana, Albania

Dr Eduardo Carmo, Director, Epidemiologic Surveillance, Ministry of Health, Brasilia, Brazil

Dr Martin Cetron, Director of Global Migration and Quarantine, National Center for Emerging and Zoonotic Infectious Diseases, Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, Atlanta, USA

Dr Omar El Menzhi, Director, Direction of Epidemiology and Disease Control, Ministry of Health, Rabat, Morocco

Dr Yuri Fedorov, Deputy Director, Federal Centre on Plague Control, Federal Service for Surveillance of Consumer Rights Protection and Human Well-being, Moscow, Russian Federation

Dr Harvey V. Fineberg, President, The Institute of Medicine, Washington D.C., USA

Mr Andrew Forsyth, Team Leader, Public Health Legislation and Policy, Office of the Director of Public Health, Health and Disability Systems Strategy Directorate, Ministry of Health, Wellington, New Zealand

Psychologist Claudia Gonzalez, Department of Epidemiology, Health Planning Division, Public Health Secretariat, Ministry of Health, Santiago, Chile

Dr Mohammad Mehdi Gouya, Director-General, Centre for Disease Control, Ministry of Health and Medical Education, Teheran, Iran

Dr Amr Mohamed Kandeel, Undersecretary for Preventive Affairs, Ministry of Health, Cairo, Egypt

Dr Arlene King, Chief Medical Officer of Health, Ontario Ministry of Health and Long-Term Care, Toronto, Ontario, Canada

Dr Ziad Memish, Assistant Deputy Minister for Preventive Medicine, Ministry of Health, Riyadh, Saudi Arabia

Professor Abdulsalami Nasidi, Former Director, Public Health, Federal Ministry of Health, Abuja, Nigeria

Professor Paul Odehourri-Koudou, Director, National Institute of Public Hygiene, Abidjan, Côte d'Ivoire

Dr Nobuhiko Okabe, Director of Infectious Disease Surveillance Center, National Institute of Infectious Diseases, Tokyo, Japan

Professor Babatunde Osotimehin, College of Medicine, University of Ibadan, Ibadan, Nigeria

Dr Palliri Ravindran, Director, Emergency Medical Relief, Directorate General of Health Services, Ministry of Health, New Delhi, India

Professor Dr Mahmudur Rahman, Director of the Institute of Epidemiology, Disease Control and Research (IEDCR) & National Influenza Centre (NIC), Ministry of Health and Family Welfare, Dhaka, Bangladesh

Professor José Ignacio Santos, Professor and Head of the Infectious Diseases Unit, Department of Experimental Medicine, Faculty of Medicine, National Autonomous University of Mexico, Mexico City, Mexico

Mrs Palanitina Tuipumatagi Toelupe, Chief Executive Officer, Ministry of Health, Motootua, Samoa

Professor Patricia Ann Troop, Independent, Former Chief Executive, Health Protection Agency, London, United Kingdom

Dr Kumnuan Unghusak, Senior Expert in Preventive Medicine, Bureau of Epidemiology, Department of Disease Control, Ministry of Public Health, Bangkok, Thailand

Professor Kuku Voyi, Chairperson, School of Health Systems and Public Health, University of Pretoria, Pretoria, South Africa

Professor Wang Yu, Director-General of Chinese Center for Disease Control and Prevention, Beijing, China

Dr Sam Zaramba, Senior Consultant Surgeon, Former Director General of Health Services, Ministry of Health, Kampala, Uganda

= = =